

Quantized Black Hole Charges and Freudenthal Duality

M. J. Duff
Blackett Laboratory, Imperial College, London

October 2013
University of Michigan

Freudenthal duality

F-dual: A discrete symmetry transformation $x \rightarrow \tilde{x}$, of a Freudenthal triple system x for which $\tilde{\tilde{x}} = -x$, preserving the quartic invariant $\Delta(x)$.

Originally introduced as a symmetry of extremal black holes in supergravity

[L. Borsten, D. Dahanayake, M. J. Duff, and W. Rubens, arXiv:0903.5517]

Other applications

- Generalised to a full symmetry of black hole potential [Ferrara, Marrani, Yeranyan, arXiv:1102.4857]
- The attractor mechanism [Ortin, Shahbazi, arXiv:1206.3190]
- Freudenthal gauge theory [Marrani, Qiu, Shih, Tagliaferro, Zumino, arXiv:1208.0013]
- Symmetry of supergravity [Borsten, Duff, Ferrara, Marrani arXiv1212.3254]

The Framework

- In quantum theory, charges are **quantized**
- We exploit the mathematical framework of **integral Jordan algebras**, the **integral Freudenthal triple system** and, in particular, the work of Krutelevich.
- [Krutelevich, J. Algebra (2002); J. Algebra (2007), arXiv:math/0411104]

Einstein-Maxwell System

- Einstein-Maxwell action and e.o.m:

$$S[g_{\mu\nu}, A_\mu] = \frac{1}{16\pi} \int d^4x \sqrt{|g|} \left[R - \frac{1}{4} F^2 \right]$$

$$R_{\mu\nu} = \frac{1}{2} \left[F_{\mu}{}^{\rho} F_{\nu\rho} - \frac{1}{4} F^2 \right]$$

Reissner-Nordstöm Black Hole

$$ds^2 = - \left(1 - \frac{2M}{r} + \frac{Q^2}{r^2} \right) dt^2 + \left(1 - \frac{2M}{r} + \frac{Q^2}{r^2} \right)^{-1} dr^2 + r^2 d\Omega_2^2$$

$$r_{\pm} = M \pm \sqrt{M^2 - Q^2}$$

$$Q = \frac{1}{16\pi} \int_{S_{\infty}^2} \star F$$

RN Black Hole Thermodynamics

Hawking temperature:

$$T_{\text{H}} = \frac{\sqrt{M^2 - Q^2}}{2\pi(M + \sqrt{M^2 - Q^2})}$$

Bekenstein-Hawking entropy:

$$S_{\text{BH}} = \pi(M + \sqrt{M^2 - Q^2})^2$$

The Extremal Limit: $M \rightarrow Q$

- Horizons collapse $r_+ = r_-$.
- Stable against Hawking radiation $T_{\text{H}} \rightarrow 0$
- But, have non-vanishing entropy $S_{\text{BH}} = \pi Q^2$

These special properties allow one derive the entropy quantum mechanically using string theory.

$\mathcal{N} = 8$

- $\mathcal{N} = 8$ single supermultiplet has bosonic sector

$$g_{\mu\nu}, \quad 70\phi, \quad 28C_\mu$$

- Scalars parametrise a homogeneous space

$$\frac{G_4}{H_4} = \frac{E_{7(7)}}{SU(8)}$$

- EOM invariant under G_4 , the U-duality group
- The fields strengths plus their duals transform linearly as the **56** of E_7

Generic supergravity

- Scalars may or may not parametrise a homogeneous space $\frac{G_4}{H_4}$
- EOM invariant under G_4 , the U-duality group
- The fields strengths plus their duals transform linearly under G_4

Extremal Black Holes in supergravity

- Solutions similar to Reissner–Nordström, but
- More electromagnetic charges in the game (56 in the $\mathcal{N} = 8$ case)

$$p^a = \frac{1}{4\pi} \int_{S^2} F^a, \quad q_a = \frac{1}{4\pi} \int_{S^2} G_a, \quad Q = \begin{pmatrix} p^a \\ q_a \end{pmatrix}$$

- There are also scalar equations of motion
- Extremal solutions “attractor mechanism” kicks in: the scalars at the horizon must be fixed in terms of the charges independent of their asymptotic values. [Ferrara:1995, Strominger:1996, Ferrara:1996, Ferrara:1996, Ferrara:1997]; the horizon area loses all memory of the scalars and is a (non-polynomial) quadratic function of only the charges, just as in the Reissner–Nordström case.
- The entropy is given by a quartic U-duality invariant $\Delta(p, q)$,

$$S_{\text{BH}} = \pi \sqrt{|\Delta(p, q)|}.$$

Jordan Algebras

A Jordan algebra \mathfrak{J} is vector space defined over a ground field \mathbb{F} equipped with a bilinear product satisfying [Jordan:1933]

$$X \circ Y = Y \circ X, \quad X^2 \circ (X \circ Y) = X \circ (X^2 \circ Y), \quad \forall X, Y \in \mathfrak{J}.$$

Jordan Algebras

A Jordan algebra \mathfrak{J} is vector space defined over a ground field \mathbb{F} equipped with a bilinear product satisfying [Jordan:1933]

$$X \circ Y = Y \circ X, \quad X^2 \circ (X \circ Y) = X \circ (X^2 \circ Y), \quad \forall X, Y \in \mathfrak{J}.$$

Cubic Jordan Algebras

Let V be a vector space equipped with a cubic norm and a base point:

- A *cubic* form:

$$N_3 : V \rightarrow \mathbb{R} \quad \text{s.t.} \quad N_3(\alpha X) = \alpha^3 N_3(X) \quad \forall \alpha \in \mathbb{R}, X \in V,$$

$$N_3(X, Y, Z) = N_3(X + Y + Z) - N_3(X + Y) - N_3(Y + Z) - N_3(X + Z) \\ + N_3(X) + N_3(Y) + N_3(Z)$$

is trilinear.

Jordan Algebras

A Jordan algebra \mathfrak{J} is vector space defined over a ground field \mathbb{F} equipped with a bilinear product satisfying [Jordan:1933]

$$X \circ Y = Y \circ X, \quad X^2 \circ (X \circ Y) = X \circ (X^2 \circ Y), \quad \forall X, Y \in \mathfrak{J}.$$

Cubic Jordan Algebras

Let V be a vector space equipped with a cubic norm and a base point:

- A *cubic* form:

$$N_3 : V \rightarrow \mathbb{R} \quad \text{s.t.} \quad N_3(\alpha X) = \alpha^3 N_3(X) \quad \forall \alpha \in \mathbb{R}, X \in V,$$

$$N_3(X, Y, Z) = N_3(X + Y + Z) - N_3(X + Y) - N_3(Y + Z) - N_3(X + Z) \\ + N_3(X) + N_3(Y) + N_3(Z)$$

is trilinear.

- A *base point*: element $c \in V$ satisfying $N_3(c) = 1$.

The Freudenthal triple system

Freudenthal triple system over a Jordan algebra \mathfrak{J} [Freudenthal:1954,Brown:1969]:

$$\mathfrak{F}(\mathfrak{J}) = \mathbb{R} \oplus \mathbb{R} \oplus \mathfrak{J} \oplus \mathfrak{J}.$$

$$x = \begin{pmatrix} \alpha & A \\ B & \beta \end{pmatrix}, \quad \text{where } \alpha, \beta \in \mathbb{R} \quad \text{and} \quad A, B \in \mathfrak{J}.$$

Defining relations

- 1 Quadratic form $\{\bullet, \bullet\}: \mathfrak{F}(\mathfrak{J}) \times \mathfrak{F}(\mathfrak{J}) \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$

$$\{x, y\} = \alpha\delta - \beta\gamma + \text{Tr}(A, C) - \text{Tr}(B, D), \quad \text{where } x = \begin{pmatrix} \alpha & A \\ B & \beta \end{pmatrix}, \quad y = \begin{pmatrix} \gamma & C \\ D & \delta \end{pmatrix}.$$

- 2 Quartic form $\Delta: \mathfrak{F}(\mathfrak{J}) \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$

$$\Delta(x) = -(\alpha\beta - \text{Tr}(A, B))^2 - 4[\alpha N(A) + \beta N(B) - \text{Tr}(A^\sharp, B^\sharp)].$$

- 3 Triple product $T: \mathfrak{F}(\mathfrak{J}) \times \mathfrak{F}(\mathfrak{J}) \times \mathfrak{F}(\mathfrak{J}) \rightarrow \mathfrak{F}(\mathfrak{J})$ which is uniquely defined by

$$\{T(x, y, w), z\} = 2\Delta(x, y, w, z).$$

Automorphism group

$$\text{Aut}(\mathfrak{F}) := \{\sigma \mid \{\sigma x, \sigma y\} = \{x, y\}, \quad \Delta(\sigma x, \sigma y, \sigma z, \sigma w) = \Delta(x, y, z, w)\}.$$

$$\Rightarrow T(\sigma x, \sigma y, \sigma z) = \sigma T(x, y, z)$$

\mathfrak{J}_3	$\text{Str}_0(\mathfrak{J}_3)$	$\text{Aut}(\mathfrak{F}(\mathfrak{J}_3))$	$\dim \mathfrak{F}(\mathfrak{J}_3)$
\mathbb{R}	–	$SL(2, \mathbb{R})$	4
$\mathbb{R} \oplus \mathbb{R}$	$SO(1, 1; \mathbb{R})$	$[SL(2, \mathbb{R})]^2$	6
$\mathbb{R} \oplus \mathbb{R} \oplus \mathbb{R}$	$[SO(1, 1; \mathbb{R})]^2$	$[SL(2, \mathbb{R})]^3$	8
$\mathbb{R} \oplus \Gamma_{1, n-1}$	$SO(1, 1; \mathbb{R}) \times SO(1, n-1; \mathbb{R})$	$SL(2, \mathbb{R}) \times SO(2, n; \mathbb{R})$	$2n + 4$
$\mathbb{R} \oplus \Gamma_{5, n-5}$	$SO(1, 1; \mathbb{R}) \times SO(5, n-5; \mathbb{R})$	$SL(2, \mathbb{R}) \times SO(6, n; \mathbb{R})$	$2n + 12$
$J_3^{\mathbb{R}}$	$SL(3, \mathbb{R})$	$Sp(6, \mathbb{R})$	14
$J_3^{\mathbb{C}}$	$SL(3, \mathbb{C})$	$SU(3, 3; \mathbb{R})$	20
$J_3^{\mathbb{H}}$	$SU^*(6, \mathbb{R})$	$SO^*(12, \mathbb{R})$	32
$J_3^{\mathbb{O}}$	$E_{6(-26)}(\mathbb{R})$	$E_{7(-25)}(\mathbb{R})$	56
$J_3^{\mathbb{O}^*}$	$E_{6(6)}(\mathbb{R})$	$E_{7(7)}(\mathbb{R})$	56

The automorphism group is generated by [Brown: 1969]:

$$\phi(W) : \begin{pmatrix} \alpha & X \\ Y & \beta \end{pmatrix} \mapsto \begin{pmatrix} \alpha + (Y, W) + (X, W^\sharp) + \beta N(W) & X + \beta W \\ Y + X \times W + \beta W^\sharp & \beta \end{pmatrix},$$

$$\psi(Z) : \begin{pmatrix} \alpha & X \\ Y & \beta \end{pmatrix} \mapsto \begin{pmatrix} \alpha & X + Y \times Z + \alpha Z^\sharp \\ Y + \alpha Z & \beta + (X, Z) + (Y, Z^\sharp) + \alpha N(Z) \end{pmatrix},$$

$$T(s) : \begin{pmatrix} \alpha & X \\ Y & \beta \end{pmatrix} \mapsto \begin{pmatrix} \lambda^{-1}\alpha & s(X) \\ s'^{-1}(Y) & \lambda\beta \end{pmatrix}.$$

Ranks

Natural, Aut invariant rank conditions:

$$\text{Rank}x = 1 \Leftrightarrow 3T(x, x, y) + \{x, y\}x = 0 \quad \forall y \in \mathfrak{F};$$

$$\text{Rank}x = 2 \Leftrightarrow T(x, x, x) = 0, \quad \exists y \text{ s.t. } 3T(x, x, y) + \{x, y\}x = 0 \neq 0;$$

$$\text{Rank}x = 3 \Leftrightarrow \Delta(x) = 0, \quad T(x, x, x) \neq 0;$$

$$\text{Rank}x = 4 \Leftrightarrow \Delta(x) \neq 0.$$

- In the classical supergravity limit the 28+28 electric/magnetic black hole charges x_I ($I = 1, \dots, 56$) transform as the fundamental **56** of the continuous U-duality group $E_{7(7)}(\mathbb{R})$. Under $SO(1, 1; \mathbb{R}) \times E_{6(6)}(\mathbb{R})$ the **56** breaks as

$$\mathbf{56} \rightarrow \mathbf{1}_3 + \mathbf{1}_{-3} + \mathbf{27}_1 + \mathbf{27}'_{-1}.$$

The charges may be represented as $x \in \mathfrak{F}(\mathfrak{J}_3^{0s}) = \mathfrak{F}^{0s}$,

$$x = \begin{pmatrix} -q_0 & P \\ Q & p^0 \end{pmatrix}, \quad \text{where } q_0, p^0 \in \mathbb{R} \quad \text{and} \quad Q, P \in \mathfrak{J}_3^{0s}.$$

Here, p^0, q_0 are the graviphotons and P, Q are the magnetic/electric **27'** and **27**.

- **Leading order black hole entropy:**

$$S_{D=4, \text{BH}} = \pi \sqrt{|\Delta(x)|} \quad (\Delta = \mathbf{1} \in [\mathbf{56} \times \mathbf{56} \times \mathbf{56} \times \mathbf{56}]_s)$$

Black hole charge orbits

Rank	Rank cond. non-vanishing	Rep state	Orbit	dim	SUSY
1	x	$\begin{pmatrix} 1 & (0, 0, 0) \\ 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$	$\frac{E_{7(7)}(\mathbb{R})}{E_{6(6)}(\mathbb{R}) \times \mathbb{R}^{27}}$	28	1/2
2	$3T(x, x, y) + x\{x, y\}$	$\begin{pmatrix} 1 & (1, 0, 0) \\ 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$	$\frac{E_{7(7)}(\mathbb{R})}{O(6, 5; \mathbb{R}) \times \mathbb{R}^{32} \times \mathbb{R}}$	45	1/4
3	$T(x, x, x)$	$\begin{pmatrix} 0 & (1, 1, 1) \\ 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$	$\frac{E_{7(7)}(\mathbb{R})}{F_{4(4)}(\mathbb{R}) \times \mathbb{R}^{26}}$	55	1/8
4	$\Delta(x) > 0$	$\begin{pmatrix} 1 & (1, 1, k) \\ 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$	$\frac{E_{7(7)}(\mathbb{R})}{E_{6(2)}(\mathbb{R})}$	55	1/8
4	$\Delta(x) < 0$	$\begin{pmatrix} 1 & (1, 1, -k) \\ 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$	$\frac{E_{7(7)}(\mathbb{R})}{E_{6(6)}(\mathbb{R})}$	55	0

[Ferrara, Gunaydin: hep-th/9708025; Lu, Pope, Stelle: hep-th/9708109]

[Sukuzawa: 2006; LB, Duff, Ferrara, Marrani, Rubens: arXiv:1108.0424, arXiv:1108.0908]

- This Jordan algebra and FTS framework can be use to classify the black holes of a large number of theories
[[Ferrara, Günaydin:hep-th/0606108](#); [Bellucci, Ferrara, Günaydin, Marrani:hep-th/0606209](#)]
- In particular $D = 4, \mathcal{N} = 2$ theories which arise from compactifying type II string theory on a Calabi-Yau
- See “Small Orbits” and “Explicit Orbit Classification of Reducible Jordan Algebras and Freudenthal Triple Systems”
[[LB, Duff, Ferrara, Marrani, Rubens: arXiv:1108.0424](#), [arXiv:1108.0908](#)]

Definition

$$\tilde{\cdot} : \mathfrak{F} \rightarrow \mathfrak{F} \quad x \mapsto \tilde{x} = \frac{T(x, x, x)}{\sqrt{|\Delta(x)|}}$$

Key properties

$$\{\tilde{x}, x\} = 2 \operatorname{sgn}(\Delta) \sqrt{|\Delta(x)|}$$

$$\tilde{\tilde{x}} = -x$$

$$\Delta(\tilde{x}) = \Delta(x)$$

⇒ The F-dual is a nonlinear transformation acting on the black hole charges which leaves the leading order Bekenstein-Hawking entropy invariant.

Quantization of charges

Dirac-Schwinger-Zwanziger quantization

Dirac-Schwinger-Zwanziger quantization condition for two dyons $x = (q_I, p^I)$ and $x' = (\tilde{q}_I, \tilde{p}^I)$:

$$\frac{1}{2}[p^I \tilde{q}_I - \tilde{p}^I q_I] \in \mathbb{Z}.$$

The charges live on an lattice and the U-duality is broken to a discrete subgroup

$$G_4(\mathbb{R}) \rightarrow G_4(\mathbb{Z})$$

Example: M-theory on a 7-torus

$D = 4, \mathcal{N} = 8$ sugra has U-duality group $E_{7(7)}(\mathbb{R})$: gets broken by stringy corrections

$$E_{7(7)}(\mathbb{Z})$$

Fundamental symmetry of M-theory [Hull, Townsend: [hep-th/9410167](https://arxiv.org/abs/hep-th/9410167)]

DSZ in FTS language

$$\{x, x'\} \in \mathbb{Z}$$

[LB, Dahanayake, Duff, W. Rubens: [arXiv:0903.5517](https://arxiv.org/abs/0903.5517)]

Integral FTS

- The integral charges implies we must use an “integral FTS”

$$\mathfrak{F}(\mathbb{R}) \rightarrow \mathfrak{F}(\mathbb{Z})$$

based on integral Jordan algebra $\mathfrak{J}(\mathbb{Z})$

- Notion made precise by S. Krutelevich
- We focus on the $\mathcal{N} = 8$ with $E_{7(7)}(\mathbb{Z})$ symmetry theory hereafter

[Krutelevich, J. Algebra (2002); J. Algebra (2007), arXiv:math/0411104]

[LB, Dahanayake, Duff, W. Rubens: arXiv:0903.5517]

[LB et al: arXiv:1002.4223]

Integral Freudenthal triple system $\mathfrak{F}^{\mathbb{O}_{\mathbb{Z}}^s}$

The **integral Freudenthal triple system** $\mathfrak{F}^{\mathbb{O}_{\mathbb{Z}}^s}$ provides a natural model for $E_{7(7)}(\mathbb{Z})$ acting on lattice of charges [Krutelevich: 2004].

- The quantized black hole charge vector is given by,

$$x = \begin{pmatrix} -q_0 & P \\ Q & p^0 \end{pmatrix}, \quad \text{where } q_0, p^0 \in \mathbb{Z} \quad \text{and} \quad Q, P \in \mathfrak{J}_3^{\mathbb{O}_{\mathbb{Z}}^s}.$$

- Here \mathfrak{J} is given by

$$Q = \begin{pmatrix} q_1 & Q_s & \overline{Q_c} \\ \overline{Q_s} & q_2 & Q_v \\ Q_c & \overline{Q_v} & q_3 \end{pmatrix}, \quad \text{where } q_1, q_2, q_3 \in \mathbb{Z} \quad \text{and} \quad Q_{v,s,c} \in \mathbb{O}_{\mathbb{Z}}^s.$$

Integral black hole canonical form

Canonical form

Every element $x \in \mathfrak{F}^{0,2}$ is $E_{7(7)}(\mathbb{Z})$ equivalent to a diagonally reduced canonical form,

$$x_{\text{can}} = \alpha \begin{pmatrix} 1 & k \text{diag}(1, l, lm) \\ 0 & j \end{pmatrix}, \quad \text{where } \alpha > 0.$$

Canonical quartic norm

$$\Delta(x) = -(j^2 + 4k^3 l^2 m)\alpha^4 \Rightarrow \Delta(x) \in \{0, 1\} \pmod{4}$$

Square of the horizon area is quantized!

- Proof [Krutelevich: 2004]

Integral black hole canonical form

- Given a discrete subgroup $G(\mathbb{Z}) \subset G$ we can define **new** invariants:

$$\text{gcd}(\mathbf{rep}).$$

[Krutelevich:2004]:

$$d_1(x) := \text{gcd}(x),$$

$$d_2(x) := \text{gcd}(3T(x, x, y) + \{x, y\}x), \quad \forall y$$

$$d_3(x) := \text{gcd}(T(x, x, x)),$$

$$d_4(x) := \Delta(x).$$

plus one more

$$d'_4(x) := \text{gcd}(x \wedge T(x)).$$

- Insufficient** to fix the can form!

$$\alpha \begin{pmatrix} 1 & (0, 0, 0) \\ (0, 0, 0) & j \end{pmatrix}, \quad \alpha \begin{pmatrix} 1 & (j, 0, 0) \\ (0, 0, 0) & j \end{pmatrix},$$

- However, in particular sub-cases they do the job.

>1/8-BPS and *projective* black holes.

>1/8-BPS black hole orbits

Assuming >1/8-BPS (Rank < 3) improved canonical form:

Every element $x \in \mathfrak{F}^{\oplus 3}_{\mathbb{Z}}$ is $E_{7(7)}(\mathbb{Z})$ equivalent to a diagonally reduced canonical form,

$$x_{\text{can}} = \alpha \begin{pmatrix} 1 & k \text{diag}(1, 0, 0) \\ 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}, \quad \text{where } \alpha > 0.$$

- Uniquely fixed by: $d_1(x) := \gcd(x)$, $d_2(x) := \gcd(3T(x, x, y) + \{x, y\}x)$, $\forall y$ since $d_1(x_{\text{can}}) = \alpha$ and $d_2(x_{\text{can}}) = 2\alpha^2 k$.

■

>1/8-BPS (Rank < 3) black hole orbit classification:

- 1 The complete set of distinct 1/2-BPS charge vector orbits is given by,

$$\left\{ \begin{pmatrix} \alpha & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}, \quad \text{where } \alpha > 0 \right\}.$$

- 2 The complete set of distinct 1/4-BPS charge vector orbits is given by,

$$\left\{ \alpha \begin{pmatrix} 1 & k(1, 0, 0) \\ 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}, \quad \text{where } \alpha, k > 0 \right\}.$$

Projective black holes

The concept of a projective element was originally introduced for the case $\mathfrak{J}_3 = \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z}$ by [Manjul Bhargava \(2004\)](#) in the context of generalising Gauss's composition law for quadratic forms.

An element x is said to be *projective* if its U-duality orbit contains a diagonal reduced element

$$x = \begin{pmatrix} \alpha & (X_1, X_2, X_3) \\ 0 & \beta \end{pmatrix},$$

satisfying

$$\gcd(\alpha X_1, \alpha \beta, X_2 X_3) = 1;$$

$$\gcd(\alpha X_2, \alpha \beta, X_1 X_3) = 1;$$

$$\gcd(\alpha X_3, \alpha \beta, X_1 X_2) = 1.$$

Projective black hole canonical form

Any projective element x is U-duality equivalent to an element (Krutelevich:2004):

$$\begin{pmatrix} 1 & (1, 1, m) \\ (0, 0, 0) & j \end{pmatrix}, \\ j \in \{0, 1\}, m \in \mathbb{Z},$$

where the values of m and j are uniquely determined by $\Delta(x) = -(j + 4m)$.

- When Δ is odd, $d_3(x) = 1$ iff x is projective

In the projective case all black holes with the same quartic norm and hence lowest order entropy are U-duality related.

Reminder: F-duality

$$\tilde{\cdot} : \mathfrak{F} \rightarrow \mathfrak{F} \quad x \mapsto \tilde{x} = \frac{T(x, x, x)}{\sqrt{|\Delta(x)|}}$$

****Not every black hole admits a well defined F-dual****

Necessary and sufficient conditions

- Requiring that \tilde{x} is integer therefore restricts us to that subset of black holes for which $|\Delta(x)|$ is a **perfect square** and for which $|\Delta(x)|^{1/2}$ divides $T(x)$:

$$d_4(x) = \left[\frac{d_3(x)}{d_1(x)} \right]^2 = \left[\frac{d_3(\tilde{x})}{d_1(x)} \right]^2 = d_4(\tilde{x}),$$

where $d_1(x) = \gcd(x)$, $d_3(x) = \gcd(T(x))$ and $d_4(x) = |\Delta(x)|$.

Discrete invariants under F-duality

- Not all discrete U-duality invariants are F-dual invariant
- For example, the product $d_1(x)d_3(x)$ is invariant but $d_1(x)$ and $d_3(x)$ separately need not be.
- However not only $d_4(x)$ but also $d_2(x)$, $d'_2(x)$ and $d'_4(x)$ are F-dual invariant.
- The invariance of $d'_4(x)$ follows from

$$\begin{aligned}\tilde{x} \wedge T(\tilde{x}) &= T(x)|\Delta|^{-1/2} \wedge T(T(x)|\Delta|^{-1/2}) \\ &= -|\Delta|^{-2} T(x) \wedge \Delta^2 x \\ &= \text{sgn}(\Delta)x \wedge T(x)\end{aligned}$$

and, hence, $d'_4(x) = d'_4(\tilde{x})$.

- Since corrections to the black hole can depend on the discrete invariants whether F-duality preserves the entropy to all orders is an open question.

Comments

- Large class of F-dual black holes
- We don't know how they are characterised
- Projective black holes:

In the projective case all black holes with the same quartic norm and hence lowest order entropy are U-duality related.

- Non-projective black holes:

Non-projective black holes related by an F-duality not conserving d_1 provide examples of configurations with the same quartic norm and hence lowest order entropy that are definitely not U-duality related,

- But more surprisingly

Non-projective black holes related by an F-duality conserving d_1 provide examples of configurations with the same quartic norm, and same discrete invariants, that are apparently not U-duality related

- Is it possible that the full space of 4-dimensional orbits could be resolved if the complete list of independent arithmetic invariants was known?
- To proceed further, it would serve us well to have a full classification of the independent $E_{7(7)}(\mathbb{Z})$ arithmetic invariants.
- When is Δ a perfect square?
- Can the class of black holes admitting an F-dual be classified in a useful way?
- If so what is its physical significance?
- Does the F-dual leave the entropy invariant to all orders? Requires a U-duality invariant black hole entropy formula for arbitrary charges
For $d_2(x) = 1$ (almost, but not quite, projectivity) entropy is determined by $d'_4(x)$ and $\Delta(x)$ [Sen: 0804.0651; Sen: 0908.0039] [Bianchi, Ferrara, Kallosh; 0912.0057, 0910.3674]
- Promote to symmetry of supergravity Lagrangians?
YES! [Borsten, Duff, Ferrara, Marrani arXiv1212.3254]